

MINUTES

Solano County Integrated Waste Management Local Task Force (LTF)

Meeting of July 19, 2018

9:00 a.m.

Solano County Administration Center

Member Organization	Representative	Present
City of Benicia	Sharon Williams	X
City of Dixon	Janet Koster	
City of Fairfield	Esther Blanco	X
City of Rio Vista	Jen Lee	
City of Suisun City	Amanda Dum	X
City of Vacaville	Samantha Brown	X
	Brian McLean	
City of Vallejo	Derek Crutchfield	X
County of Solano IWM	Narcisa Untal	X
	Colby LaPlace	
County of Solano LEA	Marcy Hannum	X
	David Weiss	X
Travis Air Force Base	Jonathan Carlson	X
	Douglas Berndsen	X
Mount Diablo Resource Recovery	Nicole Impagliazzo	X
	Gary Lazdowski	
Recology Dixon	Sal Coniglio	X
	Paul Bandettini	
	Julia Lopez	
Recology Vacaville Solano	Scott Pardini	X
	Melanie Calabrese	
Recology Vallejo	Tom Phillips	X
	Lisa Lefebvre	
	Ivonne Vaughn	X
Republic Services - Benicia	Marie Knutson	X
	Susan Hurl	
	Travis Armstrong	
Republic Services - Fairfield	Sandra Gonzalez (Chair)	X
	Kevin Flanagan	
	Colin Wallace	X
Potrero Hills Landfill	Natalie Hicks	X
	Dave Jappert	
Recology Hay Road Landfill	Greg Pryor	
	Danielle Lowther	X
	Bryan Clarkson	
Concrush	Allen Hochstetler	
	Brandon Hochstetler	
Fairfield-Suisun Sewer District	Talyon Sortor	
	Kevin Cullen	

Member Organization	Representative	Present
Recycling Zone	Jack Waite	
	Chris Aschero	
Sierra Club	Jane Bogner	X
VALCORE	Ken Hawes (Vice Chair)	
Solano Community College	Myron Hord	

GUESTS:

Ashraf Batavia, CalRecycle
 Jeff Bell, Solano County Environmental Health
 Sarah Benedict, Recology Intern
 James Dunbar, Lystek International
 Nancy Grimaldy-Carpenter, Solano County Admin
 Matthew Santos, Solano County College Intern

1. Call to Order / Introductions

Chair Sandra Gonzalez, Republic Services: Meeting called to order at 9:03 am; self-introductions of members and guests followed.

2. Public Comment

None

3. Action Items(s)

a. Minutes: January 19, 2017 & March 16, 2017

Ivonne Vaughn, Recology Vallejo: Moved to approve. Jane Bogner, Sierra Club: Second motion. Minutes unanimously approved.

4. Presentations

a. Impact of China's National Sword on Local Recycling Market

Local Solid Waste Generation: Narcisa Untal, Solano County: The County and its cities sent over a million tons of solid waste to landfill in the year 2000. That amount dropped to just over 430,000 tons in 2016 since the implementation of the Integrated Waste Management Act of 1989, or Assembly Bill 939. This mandate is on every jurisdiction to divert 50% of its solid waste from landfill annually to avoid a \$10k fine per day. The breakdown of solid waste generated within Solano County's border that is landfilled: 60% Potrero Hills Landfill, 30% Recology Hay Road Landfill, and 10% Keller Canyon Landfill in Contra Costa County. It is important to understand the role of the LEA as it relates to the local impact from National Sword. Storage of recyclables has increased due to facilities being unable to move material due to pricing, policy bans, and strict contamination rates. The LEA will require facilities to move recyclables if they violate storage time limits or to prevent a health and safety threat, such as a fire hazard, attraction of vectors, or infestation regardless of destination.

Solid Waste Facilities Regulation: Dave Weiss, Solano County Local Enforcement Agency (LEA): The LEA is certified by CalRecycle to enforce State laws related to proper transportation and disposal of solid waste at solid waste permitted facilities. The Solano County LEA is housed in the Environmental Health Division, Department of Resource Management. It is currently staffed by Dave Weiss and Marcy Hannum. Their time is focused on solid waste facilities permitting, enforcement, and inspections at Potrero Hills Landfill, Recology Hay Road Landfill Jepson Prairie Organics Compost Facility, Vision Recycling Compost Facility, Potrero Hills Compost Facility, Recology Vallejo Transfer Station, and Strategic Materials Glass Recycling. The Solano County LEA regulates Recology Vallejo who processes curbside recyclables from Dixon, Vacaville, Vallejo and unincorporated Solano County. The City of San Jose LEA regulates Newby Island Resource Recovery Park where curbside recyclables from Benicia, Fairfield, Suisun City, Travis AFB, and unincorporated Solano County are processed. The City

of Pittsburg LEA regulates the Loveridge Road Transfer Station where curbside recyclables from Rio Vista and unincorporated Solano County are processed.

Hauler's Perspective: Tom Phillips, Recology Vallejo, spoke of the impact from a hauler's business standpoint. In Fall 2017, they knew National Sword was coming. Chinese policies have taken place in the past that have impacted haulers before such as the Green Fence several years ago. They experienced some inspections and rejected loads but that was soon followed by business as usual. Not a lot of people got overly excited when the National Sword policy was implemented because the misconception was that this was just another Green Fence. Recology's commodity broker received information early on from a company that does all of their brokering that after a visit to China, this new policy was no joke. In January 2018, China shut its doors. Materials shipped out stayed in containers floating trying to find a home. Recology stopped receiving bookings and orders for material to go out. By March 2018, Recology Vallejo reached a 3,000 bail mark of material on ground when they regularly kept an average of 300 bales. Recology's main concern was not to exceed the thresholds allowed for storage time and number of bales. The Solano County LEA had been very reasonable and understanding since they had been involved from the beginning. By April 2018, Recology found a market in Singapore and Thailand where they were able to sell material. For pricing perspective, during a one-week period in April 2017, it was \$95 a ton for mixed paper; in April 2018, that same mixed paper sold for \$5 a ton. Selling it for something was the only way to move it although Recology Vallejo did experience periods of time when they just gave away material. However, it is important to note that it was not just the \$95 a ton that was being lost. Recology still had costs associated with processing, hauling, and residual disposal fees. From a business standpoint, it's difficult to stay in business when money is not earned. Recology is working diligently to find other markets but the need for domestic infrastructure is more important right now. Recology is in discussions with its municipalities to seek financial relief.

Derek Crutchfield, City of Vallejo: Is China accepting better and cleaner product from different sources?

Tom Phillips, Recology Vallejo: China is near an official declaration to not accepting anything regardless of how clean it is. They had been accepting quite a bit of cardboard so cardboard prices were considerably up from months ago. But now, China has shut the door and is not accepting anything.

Derek Crutchfield, City of Vallejo: How is China meeting the void of recyclables?

Sal Coniglio, Recology, stated that their COO met with Nine Dragons paper manufacturing company based in mainland China regarding shortfall of feedstock. Nine Dragons informed Recology that they recovered 50% of the shortfall by recycling their own waste product. Within three months, they made up 50% and will continue building programs within China. They took some of the product that was being sent to Singapore and Thailand when that material got redirected but had to be processed a second time.

Tom Phillips, Recology Vallejo: China is still taking materials from Asian countries after it has been cleaned, pulped, and palatized. Thailand is currently not allowing any scrap plastic into their country and it seems Singapore and Vietnam are in the same process. This leaves a situation of what to do next. Issue needs to be looked at long-term as it will not change. There is a concern that Recology may be left with nothing else but to landfill material, and that has not been their business model for a long time. This is a serious financial issue. Pacific Rim in Solano County shut their doors and more businesses will begin to close. Larger companies may begin to close if solution is not found. Currently working with legislators and everyone who will listen to try to find a permanent solution. A permanent solution is to build infrastructure domestically. As a company, Recology has felt the effects and have tighten how business is managed by looking closely at expenses, but there is only so much that can be done. As an industry, they are all headed towards a breaking point.

Nicole Impagliazzo, Mount Diablo Resource Recovery: Goal is to recycle and recover as much as possible but finding it difficult to get rid of 3-7 low grade plastics. China no longer accepts contaminated paper. Types of paper no longer accepted are envelopes with plastic windows, junk mail, and flyers. Unable to store materials on site for health and safety reasons. Currently educating customers on type of paper that is now acceptable and what clean means. Always searching for markets and have recently worked with Malaysia and Vietnam. South East Asia is getting inundated with recycling that China used to take, and in turn Vietnam has shut down their port due to traffic. There's little market and what is being paid for material is low. A new recycling campaign is being launched to educate customers about current recycling list, how to clean material, and what is going on with recycling markets: www.recyclecleanamerica.com The focus is to work with cities they serve and give presentations to local groups about throwing away material that would normally be recycled but is no longer recyclable due to lack of market. Re-educating public to go back to basics like when there was dual stream. It's a tough message to come across.

Colin Wallace, Republic Services: He is the municipal area sales manager and supports all of B.U.'s throughout California. They have been quite involved with California's response to China's National Sword. Mixed paper makes up (especially single stream residential) 25-35% of the waste stream, it is a big portion of what they are dealing with. Markets began tightening up February-March, and in April market basically disappeared. There was nowhere to send material therefore began stock piling. In mid-April began to find outlets for material at a cost and were paying \$10-12 a ton to get rid of it on top of transportation. Market has slowly begun to open and are now receiving \$10/ton for mixed paper. Six months ago, received \$95-100/ton for mixed paper. This is a big financial impact. To try to keep material as clean as possible and marketable have had to slow down production lines, add more employees, and add an hour to shifts addressing bails. Pacific Rim was a big partner in that large amounts of material went there. The shutdown of Pacific Rim added additional strain to facilities. Have gone to cities and asked for relief in terms of rate increases. Financial burden will continue if sales continue at the same pace, even with financial relief. Pushing National Empty Clean Dry Campaign which came out a year ago. Goal is to get material clean and dry and get contamination down.

Natalie Hicks, Potrero Hills Landfill: Since January 2018, about 1,000 tons of recyclables have been landfilled that was unable to be shipped.

Sal Coniglio, Recology: No recyclables have been landfilled. However, those communities with progressive cart pricing may experience pushback if up-sizing is needed because the cart will cost more to landfill materials that were once recycled.

Tom Phillips, Recology: Contamination in recyclables is what caused this issue. China was recycling 80% of the worlds recyclables. It's a global problem. For every jurisdiction, the biggest bang for the buck is to clean up what is being brought in. The way to do that is to begin at the curb with the customer and implementing education programs. Years ago, had the foot to lid program. Feet were put on the ground and inspected every blue cart during a month period. Tagged carts, let customer know what could or could not go in recycle bin and warning them they could be fined. This was very effective, but when they switched to automated service they lost the ability to look at every single cart. Recommended establishing programs that will get material cleaner at the curb as it goes into cart. Then they are dealing with lower amount of residual and slowing processing lines down to take time to pull contaminated material out.

Narcisa Untal, Solano County: Inquired with haulers what specific materials are contaminating the recycling stream?

Sarah Benedict, Recology Vacaville Solano: There are several things: Before we used to tell the public not to rinse containers due to water conservation; food-contaminated containers like pizza boxes and deli containers are no longer recyclable; bags of household garbage in recycle bin

when they run out of room in garbage bin. A quarterly newsletter informs customers about what can and cannot be recycled.

Narcisa Untal, Solano County: In-person public outreach to small groups has been successful in unincorporated areas. Specifically with neighborhood watch groups and homeowner's associations.

Colin Wallace, Republic Services: Fairfield has lost 30% of the revenue for commodity sales, a huge shortfall on cost. Commodity sales were subsidizing the cost, collection, and processing. The cost of collection and processing needs to start being covered in contracts, separate from commodity pricing. Education is critical, there must be contamination fees. Haulers need to be able to recover contamination fee on a quick basis. Several contracts we have 3 times you're out strike and 4th time customer is fined. This requires paying someone to flip lids and look in there. Implied the problem is how the financing is currently structured. Educating customers is going to take time. It will take fining customers to see a change. Mixed paper has been biggest issue, that is part of the 30%. Currently able to move for \$5-10 as oppose to \$100. All companies have seen a huge reduction in profit. Finding markets, but unable to cover processing and freight cost.

Tom Phillips, Recology Vallejo: Other markets have contamination limits also. They're not 0.05%, but they have limits. If you send 10 containers overseas and they are rejected at port, you have containers sitting in port and try to find another country in that area that will take them. In the meantime, you are incurring shipping charges. California allows 0% contamination to come into state. Once it leaves California it's not coming back. It can cost between \$200,000-\$500,000 for a ship load of contaminated containers to find someone to take and dispose of it. Last year, mixed paper was selling at \$155/ton, now it is at \$20/ton also cardboard was selling at \$250/ton and now is \$125/ton. Processing costs have gone up as labor and utilities increase every year. Corporate office has done several surveys and people are willing to pay for recycling. There are contracts in place that they plan to fulfill, no contracts have been broken. To save recycling market there needs to be changes. Market sales of material are no longer subsidizing the full cost of the process of collecting material. Implied public pay for the cost of collection and processing of that material. Added we may see domestic mills coming back even though they are hard to permit and restart. Gaylord Container in Antioch closed 20 years ago due to environmental regulations. There are still domestic mills, all material in the Pacific North West stays domestic.

Tom Phillips, Recology Vallejo: Proposed bringing manufacturing and processing back where there is infrastructure and opportunity like in the Pacific North West.

Marie Knutson, Republic Services: Legislation pushing rejection of certain plastics being considered? Requested CalRecycle attend September LTF to get some ideas and help cities.

Derek Crutchfield, City of Vallejo: Alameda County has banned plastic straws and instead uses paper straws. It's difficult to be the first and where Alameda makes strides in that area people tend to follow. Recalls when plastic bags were banned and nobody wanted to do anything that was going to affect business. In the City of Vallejo, after going through bankruptcy nobody wanted to do anything that would prevent people from coming to Vallejo.

Derek Crutchfield, Recology Vallejo: Is there a way to have one consistent model across the board stating how business is handled?

Sal Coniglio, Recology: It is all based on franchise agreements. Every city and processing facility is different. Municipalities are gearing towards Vacaville's three 96-gallon cart model. Before it was progressive can rates which put everyone in the 32-gallon. San Francisco is different they are in a 16-gallon cart now. It's impossible to collaborate as everyone has different needs.

Jane Bogner, Sierra Club: Encouraged product stewardship so manufacturers are responsible for non-recyclable products they produce and to take them back.

Narcisa Untal, Solano County: The County's haulers have requested meetings to discuss the impacts of National Sword locally. Recycling has always been free to customers and has been sold to the public as "free". To go back and say rates are rising due to market conditions is a major concern. The Recycling Market Development Zone loan program and business assistance program should be considered by businesses interested in a local manufacturing facility to divert recyclables. AB939 reporting cites market conditions as a reason for diversion rate decrease.

5. Public Outreach and Education

a. AB 341 – Mandatory Commercial Recycling

AB 1826 – Mandatory Commercial Organics

By: Matthew Santos, College Intern – Recycling

MSSANTOS@solanocounty.com or (707) 784-3164

Introduction of new educational web page and exemption template for businesses:

<http://recycle.solanocounty.com>

b. Used Oil Recycling

By: Matthew Santos, College Intern – Recycling

MSSANTOS@solanocounty.com or (707) 784-3164

Introduction of new GIS-based

Matt Santos (College Intern) presented Solano County's updated recycling website accessible by desktop and cell phones. Public is now able to select different materials and learn how to recycle or properly dispose of material. Business Recycling webpage available with an animated video clip explaining California's commercial recycling laws AB 341 and AB 1826. The mapping features are GIS-based.

6. Member Updates

Derek Crutchfield, City of Vallejo: Free dump day for Vallejo residents with identification on Saturday, November 3. Seeking updates to the recycling guide pages for distribution to the public. Ross-Campbell came up with a program that offered five customers \$500 off their commercial garbage bill by completing an online survey for entry into drawing. Approximately 800 post cards were mailed out to organics, commercial, and multi-family units. Only 5 people filled out survey and therefore received discount. The \$2500 came from the City's solid waste account.

Samantha Brown, City Vacaville: New to City and LTF. Focused on updating web-based tools and possible application for public to access.

Jonathan Carlson, Travis Air Force Base: Introduced Mr. Berndsen as the hazardous waste manager for Travis Air Force Base Haz Mat and will serve as LTF alternate. Mr. Carlson is the EMS coordinator as well as solid waste program manager. Currently they are updating the solid waste plan and will incorporate some of the new websites so public is aware of surrounding recycling opportunities.

Jane Bogner, Sierra Club: No cement plant, no coal in Vallejo.

Summer intern Sara Benedict was introduced, she is working on contamination project curbside. For a couple of weeks began focusing on red tagging curbside contaminations. It is giving Intern and operations the opportunity to visit or call customer and let them know contamination will not

be picked up unless it is addressed. If it is not addressed there will be an additional garbage pickup fee. So far customers are cleaning it up and there have been no fines. Intern noted the large volume of contamination products have been plastic bags, plastic film, and Styrofoam. Mr. Crutchfield added there is confusion with recycling symbol that appears on several products that are not being accepted as recycling.

Scott Pardini, Recology Vacaville Solano: Recology has expanded into Yolo County with the purchase of Davis Waste and included the hiring of all its employees.

Danielle Lowther, Recology Hay Road Landfill: Gate rate increase of \$5 beginning August 1: Going from \$30 to \$35; garbage by ton is increasing from \$60 to \$65.

Ivonne Vaughn, Recology Vallejo: Boots on the ground effort looking at multi-family housing and discerning what is out there.

Marie Knutson, Republic Services: Held four compost classes per year. For the first time they sponsored a movie called "The Symphony of The Soil" instead of another compost class. It was well attended. Working through Sustainable Solano which was Benicia Community Gardens. Next class is July 31 where they will host a drip system class for those who are unable do a rain barrel capture. Compost giveaway is August 4. Coastal Cleanup is Sept. 15. Have seen success with elementary schools in Benicia with composting and recycling in the lunch rooms.

Ashraf Batavia, CalRecycle: Manages used oil and household hazardous waste grants for Sacramento area that includes Solano County. Encouraged attendance at CalRecycle Used Oil/HHW training and symposium on September 18-21 in Garden Grove.

Marcy Hannum, Solano County LEA: Jepson Prairie Organics is going through permit revision to expand hours.

Dave Weiss, Solano County LEA: Recology Vallejo is in process of a permit revision to increase allowable tonnage for recycling in conjunction with increased trips. Tonneson Pet Cemetery has a solid waste permit as a non-hazardous ash disposal site.

Jeff Bell, Solano County Environmental Health: LEA has been keeping up with SB 1383; pilot program with a side loader inspection camera. Paradigm shift in a return to refillable glass beverage containers and therefore less plastic and cardboard will go to waste.

Narcisa Untal, Solano County: Illegal dumping education campaign; public requests more coordinated cleanups; Solano Volunteers Program; Alert Solano sign-up; Submit website updates to Matthew Santos.

7. **Adjourn**

The next meeting is Thursday, September 13 due to Used Oil/HHW Training and Symposium

8. **Informational Item(s):**

July 26-29 (Oakland): CA Resource Association 42nd Conference "Sea Change- Weathering the Storm in the Recycling Industry" From National Sword to organics diversions to food rescue, we are headed into uncharted waters. Register: <http://crra.com/conference>

September 18-21 (Garden Grove): CalRecycle Used Oil/HHW training and Symposium "Make CA the Cleanest Place on Earth"

<http://www.event.com/events/2018-used-oil-household-hazardous-waste-training-symposium/custom-22-6ff502a753a24fbc8b37ea38d321b364.aspx>

